

**HUTT CITY COUNCIL**

Minutes of an ordinary meeting of The Hutt City Council held in the Council Chambers,  
2nd Floor, 30 Laings Road, Lower Hutt on  
**Tuesday 9 July 2019 commencing at 3.00pm**

---

**PRESENT:**

Mayor WR Wallace (Chair)	
Cr G Barratt	Cr C Barry (from 3.07pm)
Deputy Mayor D Bassett	Cr L Bridson
Cr J Briggs	Cr MJ Cousins
Cr S Edwards	Cr T Lewis
Cr M Lulich	Cr G McDonald
Cr C Milne	Cr L Sutton

**APOLOGY:** Cr Barry for lateness.

**IN ATTENDANCE:**

Ms J Miller, Chief Executive  
 Mr B Kibblewhite, General Manager, Corporate Services  
 Mr M Reid, General Manager, City and Community Services  
 Ms J Livschitz, Chief Financial Officer  
 Mr M Mercer, Divisional Manager, Community Hubs  
 Mr M Sherwood, Divisional Manager for Parks and Recreation  
 Mr S Keatley, Strategic Assets and Project Manager  
 Mr B Cato, General Counsel  
 Mr H Schulze, Commercial Projects Manager  
 Ms C Ellis, Senior Communications Advisor – Media  
 Ms L Dalby, Senior Communications Advisor (part meeting)  
 Ms B Mudge, Communications Advisor – Social Media (part meeting)  
 Ms M Laban, Divisional Manager Community Projects and Relationships (part meeting)  
 Mr A Yip, Strategic Projects Manager (part meeting)  
 Ms D Hunter, Community Advisor Funding and Community Contracts (part meeting)  
 Ms L Knowles, Community Facilitator (part meeting)  
 Ms J Arait, Senior Community Facilitator (part meeting)  
 Ms C Murray, Community Facilitator – Projects (part meeting)  
 Ms D Male, Committee Advisor (part meeting)  
 Ms K Stannard, Divisional Manager, Democratic Services  
 Ms H Clegg, Minute Taker

**PUBLIC BUSINESS**

1. **APOLOGIES**

**RESOLVED:** (Mayor Wallace/Cr Bridson)

**Minute No. C 19301(3)**

*"That the apology received from Cr Barry for lateness be accepted."*

2. **PUBLIC COMMENT**

Comments are recorded under the item to which they relate.

3. **CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS**

There were no conflict of interest declarations.

Cr Barry joined the meeting at 3.07pm.

4. NAENAE POOL - INITIAL INFORMATION ON OPTIONS FOR COMMUNITY FEEDBACK (19/811)

Report No. HCC2019/3/139 by the Divisional Manager Community Hubs

Speaking under public comment, **Mr A Mitchell, representing the Naenae Residents' Association** expressed concern with the level of public consultation to date. He believed there had not been adequate public consultation both in the work leading up to the Council meeting and for the previous hub project. He urged Council to employ independent public consultation consultants to ensure the project reflected the wishes of the Naenae community. He requested that a fifth option be considered which was a new pool with a separate hub development.

Speaking under public comment, **Ms E Innes, representing the Naenae Residents' Association**, reiterated the comments made by the previous public speaker. She questioned the need for an integrated Hub. She requested full public consultation be undertaken involving the community from the start. She advocated for retaining the façade of the pool building and for celebrating Naenae's heritage.

Speaking under public comment, **Ms L Bareta, representing Naenae Residents' Association** requested Hillary Court be considered the hub of Naenae and that the plans be developed around Hillary Court. She supported the previous public speakers. She suggested a village green concept could be developed. She asked that the wishes of the Naenae community be heard. She considered the options presented in the officer's report came from the officers and not the community.

Mayor Wallace stated that Council decision today would signal the beginning of discussions with the community.

Speaking under public comment, **Mr G Hume-Cook** outlined his professional background in investigating the use of public spaces. He questioned the co-design costs as outlined in the officer's report. He added that he had examples of Australian projects delivered using co-design models, where the benefits outweighed the costs. He welcomed future discussion with officers in this regard. He congratulated Council on the mock up design incorporating Maori heritage.

Speaking under public comment, **Ms J Algar** believed this was an opportunity to bring vitality to Naenae and address the urban decay which was occurring. She urged Council to conduct meaningful public engagement including co-design as it would improve the quality of the end product. She asked for full transparency.

Speaking under public comment, **Mr C Parkin** explained that extensive consultation had not occurred and that a climate emergency analysis had not been completed. He reiterated the requests for full public consultation and questioned the need for the library to be the focus of the hub.

Speaking under public comment, **Reverend K Dickson** endorsed the comments of the previous public speakers. He requested Council talks with all users of the pool including schools.

Speaking under public comment, **Ms G Hughes** urged Council to build a new facility at Naenae as it would be a city asset. She welcomed community involvement.

RESOLVED: (Mayor Wallace/Deputy Mayor Bassett) **Minute No. C 19302(3)**

*"That public comment be extended for a period of 40 minutes."*

Speaking under public comment, **Ms H Jeffrey** advocated for people with disabilities. She offered to be the "go-between person for officers to assist with the consultation process.

Mayor Wallace advised that the Foundation for the Blind was a member of the design team for the Huia Pool extension.

Speaking under public comment, **Mr C Norton** endorsed the comments of the previous public speakers. He asked for a more collaborative approach moving forward. He acknowledged the history of Naenae and suggested there was an opportunity to assess how Naenae operated and developed as a complementary centre which would rejuvenate the area.

Speaking under public comment, **Ms G Carston** explained she was a long time user of Naenae pool. She did not want to see the "Queensgate effect" happen to Naenae if a large building was built to one end.

Speaking under public comment, **Mr B Johnston** was willing to pay an increase in rates if it resulted in a fully robust process to improve community and family facilities for Naenae.

Speaking under public comment, **Ms C Waddington** requested that Council be receptive to the wishes of the community and conduct honest and transparent consultation. She did not want pre-packaged ideas presented to the community. She suggested pop-up consultation shops be installed in Hillary Court and at other Council pools. She elaborated on the ways to engage the community and requested information be distributed in Samoan as well as English, in plain language.

Speaking under public comment, **Mrs S Weeheizen** requested the Naenae pool remain a separate entity from a hub. She considered it should be rebuilt with urgency and that it retained its Olympic pool size. She added that access to the railway station was important.

Speaking under public comment, **Mr G Rutherford** explained that although he was not a resident of Naenae, he regularly shopped there. He requested Hillary Court be rebuilt along with the Naenae pool and that plenty of carparking be provided. He was disappointed with option 5 contained in the officer's report as he believed that was not an option. He advised that the gates in the temporary fence were regularly tampered with and that people were accessing the area.

Speaking under public comment, **Ms P Hanna, Chair of Petone Community Board** believed the heritage value of Naenae needed to be recognised. She agreed with the

requests for good public consultation.

Speaking under public comment, **Ms M Stevens-Goff** requested Council listen to the people of Naenae and asked for help to make the community a better, stronger and more vibrant place by reinstating the pool and hall. She further requested all sectors of the community be recognised especially those with disabilities and women. Ms Stevens-Goff spoke in Maori, advocating that women are the guardians of humanity and the world was their oyster.

Speaking under public comment, **Mr G O'Farrell** explained his background in developing legislation and his scepticism that public consultation would be carried out meaningfully. He advised respect and trust should be the basis of consultation and that the project needed to urgently get underway.

Speaking under public comment, **Mr C Diver** endorsed the previous public speakers regarding consultation. He urged Council to communicate in a transparent way. He requested relationships be developed with meaningful engagement and conversations.

Speaking under public comment, **Ms W Bailey, representing the Hutt City Youth Council** requested energy efficient heating be incorporated into the design of the building. She urged consultation be with all groups of people, including the very young and the teenage and young adult sectors of the community. She further requested the final design be appropriate and fit for purpose for the Naenae community.

Speaking under public comment, **Ms A Ruck** requested the Naenae pool be urgently reinstated as Naenae had been slowly losing all its facilities. She asked that the Naenae Library remain in its current location with the Naenae pool at the other end of the centre. She asked that the Hillary Court area be tidied up while the pool design process was occurring. She added that currently there were no options for regular users of Naenae pool.

Speaking under public comment, **Mr V Tamihere** agreed with all previous public speakers. He requested a pool be reinstated and that Naenae not be forgotten.

Speaking under public comment, **Ms B Rancefield** explained the positive health benefits she received as a result of swimming at the Naenae pool. She questioned whether the other Council pools were under added stress while Naenae Pool was closed.

Mayor Wallace advised the other Council pools were coping.

Speaking under public comment, **Ms L Ranger** agreed with the previous public speakers. She explained that the Naenae pool and facilities were a huge factor in her decision to purchase a house in the area. She requested all future consultation on the project be conducted in plain English and that accessibility and the needs of the community should be the priority when designing a new complex.

Speaking under public comment, **Mr E Collins** explained he was the Chair of the Swim Zone Racing Club (the club). He urged Council to engage with all sporting clubs who use the pool and involve the club in the design phase. He added the club used to host many regional and some national events and that if proper consultation was not undertaken, many of these would divert to Kilbirnie. He further added the club was

ready to work collaboratively with Council and the designers.

Speaking under public comment, **Reverend Martin** explained how he had witnessed the decline of areas such as Naenae and Taita and shared the emotion of how it seemed often the poorer parts of society missed out. He urged Council to get it right for Naenae otherwise there would be an on-going problem.

Speaking under public comment, **Ms P Murray** explained she was a business owner who had yet to be approached for comment. She suggested she could assist in distributing pamphlets. She queried the extra buses that Council had stated had been implemented as no information had been received. She further suggested murals be painted on the fences surrounding the Naenae pool.

Speaking under public comment, **Mr J Ross** explained he was a swim coach based at Naenae Pool. He highlighted that it took 10 years to develop a swimming athlete of which Naenae had succeeded in achieving. He urged that full consultation occur and believed that potential athletes were missing out the longer the process took.

Mayor Wallace thanked all the public speakers and supporters for their feedback and attendance at the meeting. He assured those present that Council was committed to fully consult as this was a once in a life time opportunity to get things right for Naenae.

The meeting adjourned at 4.29pm and reconvened at 4.34pm.

The General Manager, City and Community Services, the Chief Financial Officer, the Divisional Manager Community Hubs, the Divisional Manager Parks and Recreation and the Strategic Assets and Project Manager elaborated on the report. They stressed that the matter had been dealt with urgency to assess all options and that consultation would occur on all facility options and on all funding options.

The General Manager City and Community Services advised that the concept designs contained in the report were concepts only and were commissioned to inform rough cost estimates. He added that there was an 18% contingency included in the new build option, a 30% contingency in the strengthening option and 11% contingency on the earlier stand alone hub option. He advised of a sixth option to be considered by Council which was "Option C2 - a new pool with a separate hub at a cost of \$64M. He further advised the last option of "Do Nothing" would have a price tag of between \$1M and \$2M for demolition.

In response to questions from members, the General Manager City and Community Services advised Option C2 included the costs of linking the two buildings with an atrium. He confirmed most of the funding options included some level of debt. He highlighted that officers had investigated the avenues Council had directed them and that no work had been conducted on the wider future of Naenae. He added the location of the pool was critical as it had significant implications concerning land availability, services location and the ability to provide a comprehensive facility.

In response to a question from a member, the General Manager City and Community Services reiterated that officers had investigated all options Council had directed them and held two workshops on the matter to keep Councillors informed.

In response to a question from a member, the General Manager City and Community Services advised financial costs were minimal. However officers' time and effort were considerable. He added officers had been working for the past three years on the hub concept, which had garnered a raft of important community information regarding the aspirations for Naenae. He acknowledged that work stream did not include a new pool.

The Divisional Manager, Community Hubs advised that the current siting of the Naenae library provided 905m<sup>2</sup> of land. He noted that in order to provide a hub to meet the aspirations of the community, including a library, a building of 1900m<sup>2</sup> floor area was required. He highlighted that due to stud height requirements for a sports hall and auditorium, this would require a very tall, several level high building be constructed on the existing Naenae library site.

In response to a question from a member, the Divisional Manager, Community Hubs explained the co-design option had not been fully investigated. He noted that information had been received from other local authorities who had embarked on such a process. He acknowledged the figures were rough estimates.

In response to a question from a member regarding the cost of bringing the existing pool facility up to 34% of the New Building Standard (NBS), the General Manager City and Community Services did not recommend the option be pursued as a public building should be a minimum 67% of code. He added parts of the building were currently less than 20% of NBS and that it would be a significant cost to bring them up to 34%.

In response to questions from members, the General Manager City and Community Services advised initial analysis for an economic impact assessment had commenced and would be reported back in due course. He further advised that an assessment to retain the heritage value of the façade could occur at design stage.

In response to a question from a member regarding the origin of the Maori aspect of the concept plans, the Divisional Manager, Community Hubs advised it had been gifted from a member of the original hub consultation team.

In response to a question from a member querying the omission of the public to date, the General Manager City and Community Services advised that no designs have been completed yet and Council's decision had instructed officers to consult with the community.

In response to a question from a member, the Divisional Manager, Community Hubs advised officers acknowledged that communication about the entire process was key to a successful consultation programme. He further advised that each project had multiple phases and all phases needed to be effectively communicated.

In response to a question from a member regarding energy efficient heating methods, the Strategic Assets and Project Manager advised that details and other environmentally friendly building and procurement options would be investigated at design stage. He added that the depth of the pool would also be investigated at design stage. The General Manager City and Community Services added that natural gas would not be an option.

In response to questions from members, the General Manager City and Community Services agreed to follow up the matter regarding the involvement of the voluntary

panel formed to discuss the future of Hillary Court. He advised that the necessity for the current perimeter fence around the complex related to health and safety. He noted that the possibility of a reduction in community boards was one option to save on operating costs. He acknowledged the legislation around community boards.

In response to a question from a member regarding the use of external consultants to conduct a co-design process, the General Manager City and Community Services advised officers were receptive to working with external consultants. He highlighted there were a number of suitably qualified Council officers as well.

The Chief Executive advised that it was clear the future of the community required community involvement and that as many opinions as possible should be gathered.

In response to a question from a member regarding the formation of a Project Control Group, the General Manager City and Community Services advised that would be necessary once a project had been decided upon and would involve personnel with the required expertise.

In response to a question from a member regarding the practicalities and timeframe of drawing up concept plans to refurbish the existing Naenae Library, the General Manager City and Community Services advised it was possible and officers would undertake what Council directed them to do. He reiterated the lack of space on the existing site, and that the work involved could possibly add 8 - 10 weeks to bring back to Council. He also advised the community had already indicated its preference for a multi-use space which had driven the investigations into the site next to the existing pool.

In response to a question from a member regarding the possibility of using the land for housing, the Acting General Manager, City Transformation advised a proposed District Plan Change was currently progressing which would allow for higher density housing close to commercial and transport hubs.

In response to a question from a member regarding a timeframe for the consultation phase, the General Manager City and Community Services advised that by November 2019, officers should have information from the community and aquatic users of the pool regarding the pool, hub and future direction of Naenae. He added the details of the process would be decided by the Strategic Leadership Team.

In response to questions from members regarding geotechnical information, the General Manager City and Community Services advised there was a contingency fund which could cover geotechnical investigations. He acknowledged this was an area of risk. He advised that Council's Urban Designer would be involved in the project.

In response to a question from a member, the Commercial Projects Manager advised that a 30% contingency level was normal for a refurbishment project where there were unknowns existed. He added that a new build contingency fund was significantly lower as there tended to be no significant surprises during construction.

In response to a question from a member regarding the workload of officers, the Chief Executive advised that existing staff resources were able to manage until November 2019, but that after that the situation may need to be reviewed. She added this was due to the Climate Change Emergency work also required. She also added that the Naenae

project was a priority.

In response to a query from a member regarding the status of a new facility, the General Manager City and Community Services advised that Sport Wellington and Sport New Zealand had recommended there was a need for only one large scale Olympic pool facility in the region. He agreed there may be opportunities to talk with national aquatic bodies with regard to financial contributions.

The Divisional Manager Parks and Recreation advised that the concepts included in the report provided for 80% of national standards for most aquatic sports. He added that these would provide for a training venue for national camps and facilities for local and some regional competitions without impacting on public use.

In response to a question from a member regarding the safety or otherwise of unreinforced masonry, the Strategic Assets and Project Manager advised the 1956 building had unreinforced masonry external walls and that if these were strengthened, they would be replaced with new, safer materials, designed to look older. He added the existing walls were currently unsafe and the safety perimeter fence was required to remain in place.

The General Manager City and Community Services advised officers were cognisant of the Christchurch coroner's recent decision regarding unreinforced masonry and agreed to investigate ways to address the aesthetics of the perimeter fence.

In response to a question from a member regarding retaining or removing the "Do Nothing" option from the recommendations, the General Counsel advised that all practical options were required to be investigated.

Cr Barratt endorsed the recognition of the officers and thanked the Naenae community for challenging Council to ensure that the heart of Naenae would be returned. She advised that the Naenae Pool would be discussed at the next Accessibility and Inclusiveness Plan Subcommittee meeting.

Cr Lulich stressed that it was important wider consultation, including co-design, occurred.

Cr Edwards acknowledged the difficulties with full consultation. He reiterated it was important for all options to be investigated and to take into account the wishes of the community.

Cr Lewis advocated for putting the communities in charge, for Council to consult and listen and to incorporate "bottom up" consultation.

Cr Bridson acknowledged the important decisions to be made which represented a once in a lifetime opportunity to do something special for Naenae. She urged officers to use the skills and knowledge of the Naenae community and not to design in isolation.

Cr Briggs stated that public participation was the key to the project going forward with officers having no bias or preconceptions. He added all decisions would impact on the youth and that long term financial repercussions would need to be carefully thought through.

Cr Milne commended the officers for the handling of a difficult situation. He compared the situation's impact on the finances of Council as being akin to an earthquake in that they were totally unexpected.

Cr Barry thanked the public for speaking and acknowledged all their comments. He further acknowledged the impact the closure of the Naenae pool had on the community and that thoroughness and urgency were required moving forward.

Deputy Mayor Bassett acknowledged his childhood spent in the Naenae area and thanked the community for attending the meeting. He also thanked Mayor Wallace for his leadership on the issue and fully supported a comprehensive consultation process.

Mayor Wallace stated that everyone should leave the meeting knowing Council was committed to seeing Naenae prosper with a facility built offering the best opportunities for Naenae. He gave Council's commitment to working alongside the community.

Mayor Wallace advised that Council had made additional buses available to transport patrons to Huia and Stokes Valley pools. He noted that discussions were occurring with Rata Street School to assist transporting children to other pools.

MOVED: (Mayor Wallace/Deputy Mayor Bassett)

That Council:

- (i) notes and receives the contents of the report;
- (ii) agrees that officers undertake pre-consultation in the July – September 2019 period with Naenae and the wider community on project and funding options and the wider vision for Naenae;
- (iii) agrees to consult and engage with the community on the following project options whilst not specifically limited to:
  - (a) new integrated pool and community hub;
  - (b) refurbishment of pool and separate new or existing community hub sited in Everest Avenue;
  - (c) new pool only;
  - (d) new pool on existing site and separate hub elsewhere in Naenae (eg Hillary Court);
  - (e) refurbishment of pool only; or
  - (f) do nothing (not preferred option);
- (iv) agrees to consult and engage with the community on the following funding options:
  - (a) debt funding;
  - (b) rates increase;
  - (c) removing or deferring projects already in the Long Term Plan;

- (d) asset sales;
- (e) reducing Council services; or
- (f) combination of the above;
- (v) agrees that the incoming Council reviews the results of consultation and makes a decision on the future of this project in November 2019; and
- (vi) notes that this decision is likely to require a Long Term Plan amendment process early in 2020.

The motion was taken in parts.

**NAENAE POOL - INITIAL INFORMATION ON OPTIONS FOR COMMUNITY FEEDBACK** (19/811)

**RESOLVED:** (BY DIVISION) (Mayor Wallace/Deputy Mayor Bassett)

**Minute No. C 19303(3)**

*“That Council:*

- (i) notes and receives the contents of the report;*
- (ii) agrees that officers undertake pre-consultation in the July – September 2019 period with Naenae and the wider community on project and funding options and the wider vision for Naenae;*
- (iii) agrees to consult and engage with the community on the following project options whilst not specifically limited to:*
  - (a) new integrated pool and community hub;*
  - (b) refurbishment of pool and separate new or existing community hub sited in Everest Avenue;*
  - (c) new pool only;*
  - (d) new pool on existing site and separate hub elsewhere in Naenae (eg Hillary Court); or*
  - (e) refurbishment of pool only;*
- (iv) agrees to consult and engage with the community on the following funding options:*
  - (a) debt funding;*
  - (b) rates increase;*
  - (c) removing or deferring projects already in the Long Term Plan;*
  - (d) asset sales;*
  - (e) reducing Council services; or*
  - (f) combination of the above;*
- (v) agrees that the incoming Council reviews the results of consultation and makes a decision on*

*the future of this project in November 2019; and*

*(vi) notes that this decision is likely to require a Long Term Plan amendment process early in 2020."*

Parts (i), (ii), (iv), (v) and (vi) were declared CARRIED by Division with the voting as follows:

**For**

**Against**

Mayor Wallace  
Deputy Mayor Bassett  
Cr Barratt  
Cr Barry  
Cr Bridson  
Cr Briggs  
Cr Cousins  
Cr Edwards  
Cr Lewis  
Cr Lulich  
Cr Milne  
Cr McDonald  
Cr Sutton

**Total: 13**

Part (iii) (a), (b), (c), (d) and (e). The motion was declared CARRIED by Division with the voting as follows:

**For**

**Against**

Mayor Wallace  
Deputy Mayor Bassett  
Cr Barratt  
Cr Barry  
Cr Bridson  
Cr Briggs  
Cr Cousins  
Cr Edwards  
Cr Lewis  
Cr Lulich  
Cr Milne  
Cr McDonald  
Cr Sutton

**Total: 13**

Part (iii) (f). The motion was declared LOST by Division with the voting as follows:

**For**

**Against**

Cr Edwards  
Cr Sutton

Mayor Wallace  
Deputy Mayor Bassett

Cr Barratt  
Cr Barry  
Cr Bridson  
Cr Briggs  
Cr Lewis  
Cr Lulich  
Cr Milne  
Cr McDonald

**Total: 2**

**Total: 10**

**5. QUESTIONS**

There were no questions.

There being no further business the Chair declared the meeting closed at 6.45pm.

WR Wallace  
**MAYOR**

**CONFIRMED as a true and correct record  
Dated this 30<sup>th</sup> day of July 2019**