

HUTT CITY COUNCIL**TRAFFIC SUBCOMMITTEE**

Report of a meeting held in the Matiu Meeting Room, Hutt City Council, 531 High Street, Lower
Hutt on

Tuesday 16 June 2015 commencing at 4.00pm

PRESENT:

Cr M Cousins (Chair)	Deputy Mayor D Bassett
Cr L Bridson	Cr A Finlayson
Cr T Lewis	Cr C Milne (until 5.05pm)
Cr M Willard	Mayor WR Wallace

APOLOGIES: There were no apologies.

IN ATTENDANCE:

Mr T Stallinger, Chief Executive
 Mr P Maaka, Urban Design Manager, Strategy and Planning
 Mr L Earl, Traffic Assets Manager, Road and Traffic
 Ms K Glanville, Senior Committee Advisor, Secretariat Services (part meeting)
 Ms L Herriot, EA to General Manager, Governance and Regulatory

PUBLIC BUSINESS**1. APOLOGIES**

There were no apologies.

2. PUBLIC COMMENT

Comments are recorded under the item to which they relate.

3. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS

There were no conflict of interest declarations.

MARGARET STREET PROPOSED BUS STOP (15/902)

Report No. TRS2015/3/171 by the Urban Design Manager

Speaking under public comment, **Mr P McLaughlin representing the Rock Shop**, spoke in opposition to the proposed bus stop in Margaret Street. He said that the earthquake strengthening work on the Gibson Sheat building would interrupt his access through the back of the building. He asked that members consider a temporary loading zone on Queens Drive of three car parking spaces during this time.

In response to a question from a member, Mr Laughlin said that customers utilised the car park outside the store to pick up heavy equipment.

Speaking under public comment, **Mr J Nisbet representing Hutt Valley NZ Bus**, spoke in support of the proposed new site for the bus stop. He said the current bus stop on Queens Drive was only suited for two buses at any one time and there could be up to five buses waiting causing congestion. He said passengers walked between buses to cross the road.

Speaking under public comment, **Mr G Cromie representing Rex Nullius**, expressed concern about the lack of consultation regarding the proposed Margaret Street bus stop. He said Council should consider other options.

Speaking under public comment, **Mr B Sharp representing Hutt Valley NZ Bus**, spoke in support of the proposed Margaret Street bus stop. He said this was due to a number of safety reasons including the number of buses using the stop, cars using the street and pedestrians crossing the street.

In response to a question from a member, Mr Sharp said he would support a bus hub but was unsure of a suitable location.

Speaking under public comment, **Sargent Warren Harris and Inspector George Fa'alogo, representing NZ Police and on behalf of Senior Sargent Paula Holt**, spoke in support of the proposed Margaret Street bus stop. He said it would enhance road safety and add to the prevention of crime considerations in the CBD.

In response to questions from members, Inspector Fa'alogo said he did not have crime statistics around Bunny Street and Queens Drive to hand. He said there was a few crime issues in the evenings. He noted that there had been an instance of poor behaviour amongst bus passengers at the end of last year.

Speaking under public comments, **Mr P Lyford representing Rembrandt Suits**, spoke in opposition to the proposed bus stop in Margaret Street. He said officers had consulted with the retailers last week. He considered that the proposed bus stop would not generate successful retail business in the area. He noted that the loss of carparks would impact on his clientele.

Speaking under public comment, **Mr R Small representing Pacific Legal**, spoke in opposition to the proposed bus stop in Margaret Street. He considered that the consultation period of five days was inadequate. He asked that members consider

deferring a decision to allow for all options to be investigated. He proposed alternative options for consideration.

In response to a question from a member, Mr Small confirmed that a consultation period of six weeks would be appropriate to investigate all options.

The Chair asked Mr Small to make a list of the information he required and forward the information request to the Chief Executive.

Speaking under public comment, **Tonia Haswell, Chief Operating Manager of NZ Bus**, spoke in support of the proposed bus stop in Margaret Street. She said the hazards at the current bus stop were around the dangers of five bus routes using a bus stop that was designed for two bus routes.

Officers tabled additional reports for the members information as follows:

- notes from two meetings on Wednesday 10 June 2015 and Thursday 11 June 2015 held with retailers regarding the proposed new bus stop in Margaret Street; and
- unconfirmed part minutes from the Central Community Committee meeting held on Monday 15 June 2015.

RESOLVED:**Minute No. TRS 15301**

“That the Subcommittee accepts the additional information from two meetings held with retailers on Wednesday 10 June 2015 and Thursday 11 June 2015; and the unconfirmed part minutes from the Central Community Committee meeting held on Monday 15 June 2015 attached as pages 6-10.”

Cr Milne left the meeting at 5.05pm

The Urban Design Manager elaborated on the report. He noted that the Margaret Street option was a good solution for safety issues and was the best solution available.

Mr Wayne Hastie, Public Transport Group, General Manager of Greater Wellington Regional Council advised that the officer’s report underplayed the investigation undertaken for each option. He said that the proposal had come about due to safety concerns. He acknowledged the concerns of the retailers.

In response to a question from a member, Mr Hastie advised that while this was a safety issue there could be flexibility regarding the timeframe.

The Traffic Assets Manager advised that this was not a compromise option it was the best option available.

Mr Matt Lear, Team Leader Service Design, Greater Wellington Regional Council highlighted the importance of connectivity to the Hutt Valley bus service.

Deputy Mayor Bassett spoke to the Central Community Committee unconfirmed minutes tabled at the meeting. He advised that the Committee considered that retailers had not been given sufficient notice of the proposal and asked that a decision be deferred to allow for a six week consultation period to be undertaken.

In response to questions from members, the Urban Design Manager advised that best option for the City would be a bus depot. He said that it was unlikely that the Margaret Street Night Market would proceed. He asked that members consider a four week consultation period so that the report could be considered by Council at its meeting on 28 July 2015. He further asked that the Subcommittee agreed that officers continue to draft the documentation due to time constraint.

RESOLVED:**Minute No. TRS 15302**

“That the Subcommittee:

- (i) notes the unconfirmed recommendations of the Central Community Committee tabled as pages 8-10;*
- (ii) asks that officers expedite a site visit for the Central Community Committee members and the Mayor and Councillors;*
- (iii) receives the report of proposed changes and notes that these proposed changes have been initiated due to significant safety concerns and in submissions received under public comment by members of the Police and NZ Bus;*
- (iv) asks officers to work with the affected members of the public who have given their view at the Central Community Committee at its meeting held on 15 June 2015 and at this*

- meeting over the next four weeks of consultation;*
- (v) asks officers to investigate the provision of a loading zone on Queens Drive while earthquake strengthening work is undertaken on the Gibson Sheat building;*
 - (vi) agrees that the Margaret Street bus stop proposal is deferred for four weeks to enable officers to consult with affected parties; and*
 - (vii) agrees that, due to time constraints, officers continue to draft the report for the Margaret Street bus stop proposal."*

5. QUESTIONS

There were no questions.

There being no further business the Chair declared the meeting closed at 5.55pm.

Cr M Cousins
CHAIR

CONFIRMED as a true and correct record
Dated this 28th day of July 2015

NOTES FROM TWO MEETINGS HELD RE: PROPOSED NEW BUS STOP IN MARGARET STREET.

MEETING 1: MARGARET STREET GROUP HELD 8AM WEDNESDAY 10 JUNE 2015 @ GOTHAM CAFÉ.

Attended by:

- Harriet Fraser, John Bank, Graeme Cromie, Andrew Cromie (property owners).
 - Blair Smith & Ben Blackler (Blackler Accountants).
 - Eric De Souza (Westpac).
 - Mina Kumar (Unichem).
 - John Zahariadis (Zadimas Properties).
 - Trent Stevenson (Empire Skate).
 - Paul Borrie (United Travel).
 - Richard Small (Pacific Legal).
 - Matthew Lear (Team Leader Service Design GWRC).
 - Steve (Gotham) separate meeting 11 June 2015.
 - Cyndi Christensen, Lyle Earl, Paki Maaka (HCC).
 - Apologies: Rockshop, Key Skills, Sherrington Jewelers, ANZ, Rembrandt.
1. HCC Paki presented. Detailed context, significant amount of work put in, & design of proposal.
 2. HCC Paki explained process & clarified; why presenting now, programme, dates/ meeting schedule, opportunities for & how submissions can be made.
 3. GWRC Matthew confirmed bus frequency 1x bus per 10 minutes during peak per route, & how buses will introduce 1000 patrons/ day in Margaret St.
 4. Empire Skate Trent comment: bus patrons do not spend money. Paki replied there is no evidence to support this.
 5. Pacific Legal/ Empire Skate Richard/ Trent expressed concern at loss of 5 car parks & say critical for clients to park directly outside their premises. Paki indicated recent GHD survey shows good level of car parking available within central CBD & 5 car parks is not viewed by HCC as significant loss.
 6. HCC Paki clarified shelter design to be good quality, & will consider safety & avoid blocking shop fronts.
 7. Various comments instead of Margaret St put bus stop in Bunny St, Queens Dr, Stephens Gr, High St by Countdown, west Margaret St. Paki/ Lyle/ Matthew replied; bus stops need to be where people want to be (close to Westfield), close & visible to each other so that bus services interconnect, in streets that are wide enough, away from CPTED trouble spots, within CCTV coverage, & away from conflicts with service lanes & car park entrances.
 8. Andrew Cromie / Eric (Westpac) comment: why not revert to all buses in Bunny St? Lyle replied no- longer appropriate as traffic/ bus volumes have increased and safety legislation has changed.
 9. Comment: move buses further west on Margaret St toward ANZ. Paki said this will be considered.
 10. GWRC Matthew confirmed bus services need to be grouped in the central core of the CBD.
 11. Graeme Cromie comment: perfect solution but will kill retail. Paki said no evidence to support this.
 12. John Bank comment: Is this consultation? Paki replied this is sharing information & that officers will recommend approval of the proposal.
 13. Comment: Does council have a plan B? Paki replied there is no suitable option to describe as a plan B. All alternatives are not suitable.
 14. John Bank/ Richard (Pacific Legal) comment: shame consultation could not happen earlier. Paki replied the idea was considered just before Christmas but we were not in a position until very

recently having just eliminated other strategies for the CBD road network & therefore share this as preferred concept.

15. Gotham (Steve) comments (separate meeting): proposal is good for his business 'no doubt' & good to increase exposure of Margaret St & increase visibility to what businesses are in it. HCC/GWRCX Will need to manage maintenance of shelters ie. cleanliness, rubbish, graffiti etc.
16. Rockshop (Phil) comments received by email 15 June 2015: Gibson Sheat seismic building work removes rear service access for circa 12 months. Need to consider service loading through front entrance on Margaret Street ie. temp loading zone etc.

MEETING 2: STAKEHOLDER GROUP HELD 9AM THURSDAY 11 JUNE 2015 @ THE DOWSE.

Attended by:

- Tonia Haskell (Chief Operating Officer Southern NZ Bus) & John Nesbit (Senior Duty Supervisor Hutt Valley NZ Bus)
 - Paula Holt (Senior Sergeant Youth & Community Manager Hutt Valley Police).
 - Mark Futter (CEO Hutt Valley Chamber of Commerce).
 - Gary Naylor (Retail Holdings).
 - Rhona Hewitt (Manager Bus & Ferry Operations GWRC) & Matthew Lear (Team Leader Service Design GWRC).
 - Jimmy Ballantyne, Cyndi Christensen, Lyle Earl, Paki Maaka (HCC).
 - Apologies: Westfield.
17. HCC Paki presented & detailed context in more depth than yesterday to recap on past work that this group has assisted with, the amount of work put in, & design of proposal.
 18. HCC Paki explained process & clarified why presenting now. Went to some length to clarify the programme, dates/ meeting schedule, opportunities for & how submissions can be made.
 19. Group commented upon traffic & layout issues at Queens Drive bus stop.
 20. GWRC (Matthew) explained timetables & inter-service connections.
 21. Chamber of Commerce (Mark) suggested removal of conflicts at Queens Drive by closing off entrance to Cash Converters car park. Retail Properties (Gary) said this is not acceptable to Retail Holdings who own properties associated with the car park.
 22. Comment possible to design for 3x bus bays as future proofing.
 23. Police (Paula) thinks youth less likely to congregate on Margaret Street as no service lanes.
 24. GWRC (Rhona) comment what happens if a decision is deferred or council wants more information?
 25. HCC (Paki) replied: budgets already carried over from 2014-2015 need to be spent 2015-2016. More officer work is not likely to uncover anything new unless HCC/GWRC acquires properties in order to have a stronger position & create better design choices.
 26. NZ Bus comment: real possibility of industrial action or stop is closed if no improvement soon at Queens Drive. NZ Bus indicate all parties will be accountable if there is a serious incident due to no reasonable progress being made at Queens Drive bus stop.
 27. NZ Bus, Police, Chamber of Commerce, & Retail Holdings indicated support for the proposal.
 28. NZ Bus & Police will attend the Traffic Subcommittee meeting.

Unconfirmed minutes from Central Community Committee – Monday 15 June 2015

a) **Margaret Street Proposed Bus Stop** (15/923)

Report No. CCC2015/3/168 by the Urban Design Manager

Speaking under public comment, **Mr M Lear, Project Manager, representing Greater Wellington Regional Council (GWRC)**, said that GWRC strongly supported the proposed bus stop because Hutt City was a key transport interchange. Buses delivered around 3,700 people per day to the city centre which represented approximately 2,300 individual car trips and reduced road congestion. He said bus drivers considered that the stop on Queens Drive had safety concerns. He added that Council and GWRC had considered a number of options and the Margaret Street option met the criteria for a safe and viable bus stop.

In response to questions from members, Mr Lear said that the proposed Margaret Street stop would take approximately 35% of the bus service traffic, which would be about one bus every five minutes. He said that the services which would move to Margaret Street were the 110 and the 120. He added that the street would be sufficiently wide enough for buses heading north, in one direction only. He said that with regard to passenger behaviour, there would be closed-circuit television (CCTV) which covered the street.

Speaking under public comment, **Mr P McLaughlin, representing the Rock Shop**, said that he opposed the proposal because he would need more staff and have fewer customers because of passenger behaviour. He added that the Gibson Sheat building would be earthquake strengthened later this year which would interrupt his access through the back of the building, therefore he would need to load stock through the front of his shop. He requested a temporary loading zone on Queens Drive of three parking spaces. He also said that there would be a risk of damage to his shop during the construction of the bus stop, should it proceed.

In response to questions from members, Mr McLaughlin said that he and the other retailers had been consulted by officers on the proposal last week, on Wednesday 10 June 2015 at a breakfast meeting.

Speaking under public comment, **Mr R Small, representing Pacific Legal**, said that he opposed the proposal because he had made an investment to move to the Gibson Sheat building from Taita and grow his business to nine staff. He added that there were instances of annoying, threatening behaviour from some bus users and that this would not alter between the different suburbs the buses were servicing. He said that he opposed the removal of five carparks because they were important for his business, particularly courier deliveries. He considered that the consultation period of six days was inadequate for the GWRC 10 yearly bus review. He proposed that it would be feasible to extend the current Queens Drive bus stop north instead of moving buses to Margaret Street.

Speaking under public comment, **Mr T Stevenson, representing Empire Skateshop**, said that he opposed the proposal. He added that there would be better options such as, by the Mad Butcher or outside Countdown, and there had not been enough time to explore these options.

Speaking under public comment, **Mr A Cromie, representing Maxam Corporation**, said that he opposed the proposal. He considered that this would be a temporary solution and there would be better options, such as using Bunny Street and putting buses on the periphery and keeping them out of town. He added that Margaret Street was a boutique street and he would like that to remain.

Speaking under public comment, **Mr G Cromie, representing Res Nullius**, said that the bigger issue for retailers was the dying of retail space in the strip shopping space. He added that there had been insufficient time for consultation.

Ms J Thompson read out four written public comments:

- **Mr B Blackler and Mr B Smith, representing Blackler Smith & Co**, who said that they opposed the proposed bus stop because of antisocial behaviours, potential for damage to their property, increased business expenses and loss of carparks. They proposed a compromise which would entail only one bus service using Margaret Street.
- **Senior Sergeant P Holt, representing Lower Hutt Police**, who said that the proposal made sense and Police supported the bus stop in Margaret Street.
- **Ms B Whiteside, representing Cash Converters**, who said that she supported the proposal for another bus stop to be put into Margaret Street to avoid any more congestion in Queens Drive, which was already highly congested with traffic coming in and out of Westfield.
- **Ms A McKone**, who said that there would be more space for bus users on Margaret Street. She said that she had concerns about the turning circle for buses into High Street where there was angle parking which limited visibility for drivers.

The Urban Design Manager elaborated on the report. He said that the delay in consultation had arisen because officers had been working on wider road network strategy and that it had not been until early May when they had been able to explore the bus issues again. He added that GWRC had a fixed timetable and needed to implement changes in November 2015. He said that he had been as transparent over the past week as he could have been, given the tight schedule for implementation. He said that buses in Queens Drive had a safety issue of buses backing up into the carriageway and large numbers of pedestrians on the footpath. He considered that this would be an opportunity to fix a number of problems, and added that recent improvements had reduced the crime rate considerably on Bunny Street. He said that officers had investigated other options, extending the stop on Queens Drive conflicted with private driveways, Bunny Street could not accommodate all bus services, southern Queens Drive had service lane conflicts, and that all three streets were too narrow to accommodate adequate waiting

facilities. He added that New Zealand Bus may consider decommissioning the Queens Drive stop if the safety problems were not resolved.

In response to questions from members, the Urban Design Manager said that officers may be able to delay the proposal for a month and still meet the implementation date in November 2015. He said that if the Queens Drive stop was decommissioned, then the next closest stop would be on High Street north of McDonalds. He added that a bus stop outside Countdown did not offer line-of-sight for connecting bus services.

In response to questions from members, the Traffic Assets Manager said that officers had reviewed the turning circle for buses from Margaret Street into High Street and that there would be sufficient space for the angle parks to remain. However the situation would be reviewed after implementation of the bus stop. He added that a bus consultation group, the Bunny Street Stakeholder Group, had been set up in 2011 which included NZ Bus, Westfield, Retail Holdings, taxis, Police and Capital Properties. He added that he was not aware of an accident record for the Queens Drive stop.

Members considered that the consultation period needed to be extended to a six week period to allow the Committee to further consider submitters' ideas and concerns and undertake an on-site visit. Members asked officers to read out the public speakers' comments of this meeting at the Traffic Subcommittee to be held on 16 June 2015.

RECOMMENDED:

Minute No. CCC 15303

"That the Committee:

- (i) recommends that the Traffic Subcommittee reads out public speakers' comments relating to the proposed Margaret Street bus stop at its meeting to be held on 16 June 2015; and*
- (ii) recommends that the Traffic Subcommittee defers the Margaret Street Bus Stop proposal for six weeks to enable the Committee to further consider submitters' ideas and concerns and undertake an on-site visit."*